

Bid Comparison

Contract ID: 489-338
Contract Year: 2010
Description: Grading for the widening and re-establishment of drainage for Montcalm Ave. From 3800' South (1100' N. of Buttoin Rd) to 400' North of Seven Mile Road. Otisco Township
Location:
Projects(s): 489-338

Rank	Bidder	Total Bid	% Over Low	% Over Est.
0	ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE	\$212,732.90	7.57%	0%
1	(_10000) Griffelle Development	\$197,751.70	0%	-7.04%
2	(04063) Youngstrom Contracting, Inc.	\$199,886.10	1.07%	-6.03%
3	(08329) CL Trucking & Excavating, LLC.	\$213,267.22	7.84%	0.25%
4	(08797) Wonsey Tree Service, Inc.	\$221,449.70	11.98%	4.09%
5	(04476) D.J. McQuestion & Sons, Inc.	\$225,120.10	13.83%	5.82%
6	(03602) Ron Meyer & Associates Excavating, Inc.	\$229,897.50	16.25%	8.06%
7	(05515) Risner Sand & Gravel LLC	\$230,198.70	16.40%	8.21%
8	(_9) Simmons Excavating LLC	\$237,140.25	19.91%	11.47%
9	(_6) Nashville Construction Company	\$277,389.91	40.27%	30.39%

10	(05566) Dean's Landscaping & Excavating, Inc.	\$292,395.72	47.86%	37.44%
11	(03353) Cadwell Brothers Construction Company	\$317,272.75	60.43%	49.14%

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		(1) Griffelle Development		(2) Youngstrom Contracting, Inc.	
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0001	2017002 _ Clearing, Modified	55.00	Sta	\$250.00	\$13,750.00	\$170.00	\$9,350.00	\$150.00	\$8,250.00
0002	2020002 Tree, Rem, 19 inch to 36 inch	10.00	Ea	\$650.00	\$6,500.00	\$230.00	\$2,300.00	\$400.00	\$4,000.00
0003	2020003 Tree, Rem, 37 inch or larger	2.00	Ea	\$1,200.00	\$2,400.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00	\$750.00	\$1,500.00
0004	2020004 Tree, Rem, 6 inch to 18 inch	20.00	Ea	\$125.00	\$2,500.00	\$50.00	\$1,000.00	\$75.00	\$1,500.00
0005	2030001 Culv, Rem, Less than 24 inch	10.00	Ea	\$125.00	\$1,250.00	\$125.00	\$1,250.00	\$150.00	\$1,500.00
0006	2030002 Culv, Rem, 24 inch to 48 inch	2.00	Ea	\$300.00	\$600.00	\$250.00	\$500.00	\$250.00	\$500.00
0007	2050010 Embankment, CIP	9,260.00	Cyd	\$3.25	\$30,095.00	\$1.02	\$9,445.20	\$1.25	\$11,575.00
0008	2050016 Excavation, Earth	9,474.00	Cyd	\$2.80	\$26,527.20	\$1.02	\$9,663.48	\$1.25	\$11,842.50
0009	2050041 Subgrade Undercutting, Type II	250.00	Cyd	\$10.00	\$2,500.00	\$1.25	\$312.50	\$10.00	\$2,500.00
0010	2080025 Erosion Control, Silt Fence	600.00	Ft	\$1.75	\$1,050.00	\$1.00	\$600.00	\$1.00	\$600.00
0011	3010002 Subbase, CIP	200.00	Cyd	\$5.50	\$1,100.00	\$8.35	\$1,670.00	\$10.00	\$2,000.00
0012	3067011 _ 23A Limestone Aggregate Surface, 6 inch	13,000.00	Syd	\$4.50	\$58,500.00	\$5.80	\$75,400.00	\$5.75	\$74,750.00

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		(1) Griffelle Development		(2) Youngstrom Contracting, Inc.	
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0013	3070022	207.00	Cyd	\$16.00	\$3,312.00	\$9.04	\$1,871.28	\$15.00	\$3,105.00
	Approach, CI II, CIP								
0014	4010000	520.00	Ft	\$20.00	\$10,400.00	\$12.65	\$6,578.00	\$18.00	\$9,360.00
	Culv, CI A, 12 inch								
0015	4010001	34.00	Ft	\$30.00	\$1,020.00	\$19.42	\$660.28	\$30.00	\$1,020.00
	Culv, CI A, 15 inch								
0016	4017001	85.00	Ft	\$210.00	\$17,850.00	\$374.74	\$31,852.90	\$273.00	\$23,205.00
	_ Culv, CSP, Arch, CI A, Polymer Coated, 117 inch X 79 inch W/ 1 on 2 Beveled Ends								
0017	4017001	78.00	Ft	\$97.00	\$7,566.00	\$221.77	\$17,298.06	\$175.00	\$13,650.00
	_ Culv, CSP, Arch, CI A, Polymer Coated, 60 inch X 46 inch W/ 1 on 2 Beveled Ends								
0018	4040073	200.00	Ft	\$4.50	\$900.00	\$3.36	\$672.00	\$3.00	\$600.00
	Underdrain, Subgrade, 6 inch								
0019	5020061	14.00	Ton	\$110.00	\$1,540.00	\$97.00	\$1,358.00	\$100.00	\$1,400.00
	HMA Approach								
0020	8070095	18.00	Ea	\$48.00	\$864.00	\$36.00	\$648.00	\$75.00	\$1,350.00
	Post, Mailbox								
0021	8127051	1.00	LS	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$1,960.00	\$1,960.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00
	_ Maintaining Traffic								
0022	8130010	120.00	Syd	\$18.00	\$2,160.00	\$24.00	\$2,880.00	\$30.00	\$3,600.00
	Riprap, Plain								
0023	8160027	1,566.00	Syd	\$0.90	\$1,409.40	\$1.00	\$1,566.00	\$1.00	\$1,566.00
	Mulch Blanket								
0024	8160028	1,000.00	Syd	\$1.20	\$1,200.00	\$1.45	\$1,450.00	\$1.00	\$1,000.00
	Mulch Blanket, High Velocity								
0025	8167011	15,466.00	Syd	\$1.05	\$16,239.30	\$1.00	\$15,466.00	\$1.10	\$17,012.60
	_ Slope Restoration								
0026	8210010	2.00	Ea	\$250.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00
	Monument Preservation								
Bid Totals:				\$212,732.90		\$197,751.70		\$199,886.10	

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(3) CL Trucking & Excavating, LLC.		(4) Wonsey Tree Service, Inc.		(5) D.J. McQuestion & Sons, Inc.	
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0001	2017002 _ Clearing, Modified	55.00	Sta	\$245.00	\$13,475.00	\$75.00	\$4,125.00	\$327.00	\$17,985.00
0002	2020002 Tree, Rem, 19 inch to 36 inch	10.00	Ea	\$415.00	\$4,150.00	\$300.00	\$3,000.00	\$500.00	\$5,000.00
0003	2020003 Tree, Rem, 37 inch or larger	2.00	Ea	\$1,025.00	\$2,050.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00	\$650.00	\$1,300.00
0004	2020004 Tree, Rem, 6 inch to 18 inch	20.00	Ea	\$95.00	\$1,900.00	\$200.00	\$4,000.00	\$150.00	\$3,000.00
0005	2030001 Culv, Rem, Less than 24 inch	10.00	Ea	\$100.00	\$1,000.00	\$200.00	\$2,000.00	\$200.00	\$2,000.00
0006	2030002 Culv, Rem, 24 inch to 48 inch	2.00	Ea	\$300.00	\$600.00	\$750.00	\$1,500.00	\$300.00	\$600.00
0007	2050010 Embankment, CIP	9,260.00	Cyd	\$2.03	\$18,797.80	\$2.50	\$23,150.00	\$2.29	\$21,205.40
0008	2050016 Excavation, Earth	9,474.00	Cyd	\$2.03	\$19,232.22	\$2.50	\$23,685.00	\$2.00	\$18,948.00
0009	2050041 Subgrade Undercutting, Type II	250.00	Cyd	\$4.35	\$1,087.50	\$10.00	\$2,500.00	\$7.00	\$1,750.00
0010	2080025 Erosion Control, Silt Fence	600.00	Ft	\$1.50	\$900.00	\$1.50	\$900.00	\$2.00	\$1,200.00
0011	3010002 Subbase, CIP	200.00	Cyd	\$4.35	\$870.00	\$7.00	\$1,400.00	\$8.00	\$1,600.00
0012	3067011 _ 23A Limestone Aggregate Surface, 6 inch	13,000.00	Syd	\$5.23	\$67,990.00	\$6.35	\$82,550.00	\$5.78	\$75,140.00
0013	3070022 Approach, CI II, CIP	207.00	Cyd	\$18.00	\$3,726.00	\$15.00	\$3,105.00	\$25.00	\$5,175.00
0014	4010000 Culv, CI A, 12 inch	520.00	Ft	\$17.00	\$8,840.00	\$12.00	\$6,240.00	\$18.00	\$9,360.00
0015	4010001 Culv, CI A, 15 inch	34.00	Ft	\$19.00	\$646.00	\$19.00	\$646.00	\$30.00	\$1,020.00
0016	4017001 _ Culv, CSP, Arch, CI A, Polymer Coated, 117 inch X 79 inch W/ 1 on 2 Beveled Ends	85.00	Ft	\$231.50	\$19,677.50	\$168.00	\$14,280.00	\$215.00	\$18,275.00

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	Description	(3) CL Trucking & Excavating, LLC.		(4) Wonsey Tree Service, Inc.		(5) D.J. McQuestion & Sons, Inc.	
					Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0017	4017001	78.00	Ft	_ Culv, CSP, Arch, CI A, Polymer Coated, 60 inch X 46 inch W/ 1 on 2 Beveled Ends	\$124.00	\$9,672.00	\$109.00	\$8,502.00	\$131.00	\$10,218.00
0018	4040073	200.00	Ft	Underdrain, Subgrade, 6 inch	\$3.75	\$750.00	\$4.50	\$900.00	\$1.00	\$200.00
0019	5020061	14.00	Ton	HMA Approach	\$145.00	\$2,030.00	\$325.00	\$4,550.00	\$200.00	\$2,800.00
0020	8070095	18.00	Ea	Post, Mailbox	\$30.00	\$540.00	\$50.00	\$900.00	\$50.00	\$900.00
0021	8127051	1.00	LS	_ Maintaining Traffic	\$2,200.00	\$2,200.00	\$1,950.00	\$1,950.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00
0022	8130010	120.00	Syd	Riprap, Plain	\$25.00	\$3,000.00	\$35.00	\$4,200.00	\$35.00	\$4,200.00
0023	8160027	1,566.00	Syd	Mulch Blanket	\$0.95	\$1,487.70	\$0.95	\$1,487.70	\$0.85	\$1,331.10
0024	8160028	1,000.00	Syd	Mulch Blanket, High Velocity	\$1.00	\$1,000.00	\$1.10	\$1,100.00	\$1.00	\$1,000.00
0025	8167011	15,466.00	Syd	_ Slope Restoration	\$1.75	\$27,065.50	\$1.50	\$23,199.00	\$1.10	\$17,012.60
0026	8210010	2.00	Ea	Monument Preservation	\$290.00	\$580.00	\$290.00	\$580.00	\$700.00	\$1,400.00
Bid Totals:						\$213,267.22		\$221,449.70		\$225,120.10

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(6) Ron Meyer & Associates Excavating, Inc.		(7) Risner Sand & Gravel LLC		(8) Simmons Excavating LLC	
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0001	2017002 _ Clearing, Modified	55.00	Sta	\$250.00	\$13,750.00	\$200.00	\$11,000.00	\$500.00	\$27,500.00
0002	2020002 Tree, Rem, 19 inch to 36 inch	10.00	Ea	\$420.00	\$4,200.00	\$250.00	\$2,500.00	\$400.00	\$4,000.00
0003	2020003 Tree, Rem, 37 inch or larger	2.00	Ea	\$1,050.00	\$2,100.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00
0004	2020004 Tree, Rem, 6 inch to 18 inch	20.00	Ea	\$100.00	\$2,000.00	\$90.00	\$1,800.00	\$75.00	\$1,500.00
0005	2030001 Culv, Rem, Less than 24 inch	10.00	Ea	\$200.00	\$2,000.00	\$150.00	\$1,500.00	\$200.00	\$2,000.00
0006	2030002 Culv, Rem, 24 inch to 48 inch	2.00	Ea	\$700.00	\$1,400.00	\$300.00	\$600.00	\$400.00	\$800.00
0007	2050010 Embankment, CIP	9,260.00	Cyd	\$1.50	\$13,890.00	\$3.15	\$29,169.00	\$3.00	\$27,780.00
0008	2050016 Excavation, Earth	9,474.00	Cyd	\$1.20	\$11,368.80	\$3.50	\$33,159.00	\$3.00	\$28,422.00
0009	2050041 Subgrade Undercutting, Type II	250.00	Cyd	\$17.00	\$4,250.00	\$12.00	\$3,000.00	\$8.00	\$2,000.00
0010	2080025 Erosion Control, Silt Fence	600.00	Ft	\$1.75	\$1,050.00	\$2.00	\$1,200.00	\$3.00	\$1,800.00
0011	3010002 Subbase, CIP	200.00	Cyd	\$5.80	\$1,160.00	\$8.00	\$1,600.00	\$10.00	\$2,000.00
0012	3067011 _ 23A Limestone Aggregate Surface, 6 inch	13,000.00	Syd	\$6.50	\$84,500.00	\$6.01	\$78,130.00	\$5.92	\$76,960.00
0013	3070022 Approach, CI II, CIP	207.00	Cyd	\$6.00	\$1,242.00	\$16.50	\$3,415.50	\$8.00	\$1,656.00
0014	4010000 Culv, CI A, 12 inch	520.00	Ft	\$14.00	\$7,280.00	\$18.00	\$9,360.00	\$17.00	\$8,840.00
0015	4010001 Culv, CI A, 15 inch	34.00	Ft	\$18.00	\$612.00	\$35.00	\$1,190.00	\$19.00	\$646.00
0016	4017001 _ Culv, CSP, Arch, CI A, Polymer Coated, 117 inch X 79 inch W/ 1 on 2 Beveled Ends	85.00	Ft	\$265.00	\$22,525.00	\$215.00	\$18,275.00	\$167.05	\$14,199.25

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(6) Ron Meyer & Associates Excavating, Inc.		(7) Risner Sand & Gravel LLC		(8) Simmons Excavating LLC	
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0017	4017001	78.00	Ft	\$170.00	\$13,260.00	\$125.00	\$9,750.00	\$70.50	\$5,499.00
	_ Culv, CSP, Arch, CI A, Polymer Coated, 60 inch X 46 inch W/ 1 on 2 Beveled Ends								
0018	4040073	200.00	Ft	\$6.50	\$1,300.00	\$5.00	\$1,000.00	\$7.00	\$1,400.00
	Underdrain, Subgrade, 6 inch								
0019	5020061	14.00	Ton	\$160.00	\$2,240.00	\$75.00	\$1,050.00	\$200.00	\$2,800.00
	HMA Approach								
0020	8070095	18.00	Ea	\$40.00	\$720.00	\$75.00	\$1,350.00	\$30.00	\$540.00
	Post, Mailbox								
0021	8127051	1.00	LS	\$4,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$3,500.00	\$3,500.00	\$1,800.00	\$1,800.00
	_ Maintaining Traffic								
0022	8130010	120.00	Syd	\$40.00	\$4,800.00	\$35.00	\$4,200.00	\$20.00	\$2,400.00
	Riprap, Plain								
0023	8160027	1,566.00	Syd	\$1.25	\$1,957.50	\$1.75	\$2,740.50	\$2.00	\$3,132.00
	Mulch Blanket								
0024	8160028	1,000.00	Syd	\$1.40	\$1,400.00	\$2.25	\$2,250.00	\$2.00	\$2,000.00
	Mulch Blanket, High Velocity								
0025	8167011	15,466.00	Syd	\$1.70	\$26,292.20	\$0.45	\$6,959.70	\$1.00	\$15,466.00
	_ Slope Restoration								
0026	8210010	2.00	Ea	\$300.00	\$600.00	\$250.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00
	Monument Preservation								
Bid Totals:				\$229,897.50		\$230,198.70		\$237,140.25	

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(9) Nashville Construction Company		(10) Dean's Landscaping & Excavating, Inc.		(11) Cadwell Brothers Construction Company	
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0001	2017002 _ Clearing, Modified	55.00	Sta	\$195.00	\$10,725.00	\$245.00	\$13,475.00	\$557.10	\$30,640.50
0002	2020002 Tree, Rem, 19 inch to 36 inch	10.00	Ea	\$400.00	\$4,000.00	\$415.00	\$4,150.00	\$678.45	\$6,784.50
0003	2020003 Tree, Rem, 37 inch or larger	2.00	Ea	\$1,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$1,025.00	\$2,050.00	\$1,356.95	\$2,713.90
0004	2020004 Tree, Rem, 6 inch to 18 inch	20.00	Ea	\$75.00	\$1,500.00	\$95.00	\$1,900.00	\$339.25	\$6,785.00
0005	2030001 Culv, Rem, Less than 24 inch	10.00	Ea	\$250.00	\$2,500.00	\$100.00	\$1,000.00	\$248.45	\$2,484.50
0006	2030002 Culv, Rem, 24 inch to 48 inch	2.00	Ea	\$800.00	\$1,600.00	\$1,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$914.90	\$1,829.80
0007	2050010 Embankment, CIP	9,260.00	Cyd	\$2.50	\$23,150.00	\$2.50	\$23,150.00	\$3.65	\$33,799.00
0008	2050016 Excavation, Earth	9,474.00	Cyd	\$3.50	\$33,159.00	\$5.28	\$50,022.72	\$3.60	\$34,106.40
0009	2050041 Subgrade Undercutting, Type II	250.00	Cyd	\$15.00	\$3,750.00	\$12.00	\$3,000.00	\$9.35	\$2,337.50
0010	2080025 Erosion Control, Silt Fence	600.00	Ft	\$1.50	\$900.00	\$2.50	\$1,500.00	\$1.40	\$840.00
0011	3010002 Subbase, CIP	200.00	Cyd	\$10.50	\$2,100.00	\$6.50	\$1,300.00	\$9.35	\$1,870.00
0012	3067011 _ 23A Limestone Aggregate Surface, 6 inch	13,000.00	Syd	\$7.34	\$95,420.00	\$6.90	\$89,700.00	\$6.55	\$85,150.00
0013	3070022 Approach, CI II, CIP	207.00	Cyd	\$38.00	\$7,866.00	\$33.00	\$6,831.00	\$43.45	\$8,994.15
0014	4010000 Culv, CI A, 12 inch	520.00	Ft	\$26.00	\$13,520.00	\$17.00	\$8,840.00	\$16.85	\$8,762.00
0015	4010001 Culv, CI A, 15 inch	34.00	Ft	\$28.00	\$952.00	\$37.00	\$1,258.00	\$20.15	\$685.10
0016	4017001 _ Culv, CSP, Arch, CI A, Polymer Coated, 117 inch X 79 inch W/ 1 on 2 Beveled Ends	85.00	Ft	\$207.59	\$17,645.15	\$350.00	\$29,750.00	\$279.10	\$23,723.50

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	Description	(9) Nashville Construction Company		(10) Dean's Landscaping & Excavating, Inc.		(11) Cadwell Brothers Construction Company	
					Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0017	4017001	78.00	Ft	_ Culv, CSP, Arch, CI A, Polymer Coated, 60 inch X 46 inch W/ 1 on 2 Beveled Ends	\$109.42	\$8,534.76	\$218.00	\$17,004.00	\$232.75	\$18,154.50
0018	4040073	200.00	Ft	Underdrain, Subgrade, 6 inch	\$5.00	\$1,000.00	\$3.00	\$600.00	\$4.70	\$940.00
0019	5020061	14.00	Ton	HMA Approach	\$200.00	\$2,800.00	\$100.00	\$1,400.00	\$161.25	\$2,257.50
0020	8070095	18.00	Ea	Post, Mailbox	\$40.00	\$720.00	\$50.00	\$900.00	\$121.80	\$2,192.40
0021	8127051	1.00	LS	_ Maintaining Traffic	\$3,000.00	\$3,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$8,795.00	\$8,795.00
0022	8130010	120.00	Syd	Riprap, Plain	\$40.00	\$4,800.00	\$30.00	\$3,600.00	\$35.70	\$4,284.00
0023	8160027	1,566.00	Syd	Mulch Blanket	\$1.00	\$1,566.00	\$1.00	\$1,566.00	\$0.60	\$939.60
0024	8160028	1,000.00	Syd	Mulch Blanket, High Velocity	\$1.25	\$1,250.00	\$1.20	\$1,200.00	\$0.75	\$750.00
0025	8167011	15,466.00	Syd	_ Slope Restoration	\$2.00	\$30,932.00	\$1.50	\$23,199.00	\$1.65	\$25,518.90
0026	8210010	2.00	Ea	Monument Preservation	\$1,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00	\$967.50	\$1,935.00
Bid Totals:						\$277,389.91		\$292,395.72		\$317,272.75